

DRAFT

Creating Rubrics for Key Assessments

Value:

- Provide students specific feedback for performance improvement.
- Provide an examination of the extent to which specific criteria has been met (at the aggregate level) for assignment/assessment improvement and overall program improvement.

Sample Analytic Rubric Structure:

	Scoring Performance Levels (Quality Levels – these three are commonly used by NCATE and various national associations)		
Column 1: List of product, performance or process assignment elements /criterion (align and link to association standards, e.g., CEC, TESOL, NAEYC, etc.).	(A) Unacceptable (decide on a point value for “Unacceptable” column)	(B) Acceptable (decide on a point value for “Acceptable “ column)	(C) Target (decide on a point value for “Target” column)
Element /criterion (1)	Score Category (1A) Qualities of Lower level performance for Element “1”	Score Category (1B) Qualities of mid-level performance for Element “1”	Score Category (1C) Qualities of Top level performance for Element “1”
Element/criterion (2)	(2A)	(2B)	(2C)

How to Create Rubrics that Meet the Requirements of Accreditation Organizations:

1. Identify the specific elements/criterion of the student’s assignment - product, performance, or process - (column 1) and the necessary qualities to demonstrate proficient (Target) performance (the highest level) (1A). These elements should be outlined in the student’s assignment. Each element should have a descriptive word or phrase and, if applicable, a numeric weight to be applied.
2. The qualities defined for top performance will form the top level of the scoring criteria for the scoring rubric (Target).
3. Once the top level of performance is defined, define the lowest level of performance (Unacceptable).

DRAFT

4. Contrast the top and the lowest levels to identify at least one middle score level (Acceptable).
5. Use descriptive words to define performance in each score category. Avoid judgmental statements. Provide enough detailed information about the assessment activity that program reviewers can clearly see the behavior expectation of candidates. DO NOT include vague language that can be broadly interpreted.
6. **Cross-reference rubric elements with specific association standard elements.**
7. Performance expectations can be grouped by association standard to include standard sub-elements (e.g., 2.3 a, b, c).
8. Try to avoid grouping performance expectations across association standards unless it makes sense to do so (e.g. 2.3, 4.6, 5.4, etc.). Make sure each element focuses on standards that teach directly to the specific association standards identified. It is difficult to determine how well a candidate is achieving mastery on any one standard element if this is not done.
9. Include all performance measures that are of importance (not just those that are covered by an associations standards).

Please note that aggregated data results will be needed by standard elements (e.g., 2.3, 4.6, etc.) for each course. All sections of one course must use the same rubric for key assessments in order to aggregate the results for the course.

Sample LiveText Rubric:

Old Dominion University Core Lesson Plan

This rubric will be used to assess lesson plans that embed differentiated instructional strategies. Be sure that your lesson plan is generated based on the learning theory and/or methods required by your instructor.

Edit

Rubric

Rubric

	Unacceptable (1 pt)	Acceptable (2 pts)	Target (3 pts)
Overview			
Lesson Description (1, 8%) ACEI.2.a ACEI.3	The section is not fully completed. The description of what occurs in the lesson is	Lesson title, grade, and/or subject is not clearly stated. A brief, concise description of	Lesson title, grade, and subject are clearly stated. A brief, concise description of what occurs in the

DRAFT

Rubric

	Unacceptable (1 pt)	Acceptable (2 pts)	Target (3 pts)
	vague.	what occurs in the lesson is included.	lesson is included.
Standards Objectives (1, 8%) ACEI.2.a ACEI.2.i ACEI.4 NCATE.1.B	The lesson plan goals and objectives are not aligned with state and/or district standards. Objectives include a mix of student oriented and teacher oriented objectives; has minimal levels of Bloom's Taxonomy; too many or too few objectives; several seem inappropriate.	The lesson plan goals and objectives are aligned with state standards. Objectives are student oriented; covers some of Bloom's Taxonomy; some somewhat inappropriate for lesson.	The lesson plan goals and objectives are aligned with national, state, and district standards. Objectives are student oriented; spans levels of Bloom's Taxonomy; are appropriate for the lesson; are measurable outcomes aligned with assessments; and are clearly stated.
Focus (1, 8%) ACEI.1 NCATE.1.B	The enduring understandings do not clearly reflect the concepts, "big ideas", of the standard. The essential questions are not developed to provoke interest and focus students' attention on the lesson.	The enduring understandings reflect the concepts, "big ideas", of the standard. The essential questions address the heart of the discipline, some are not framed to provoke interest and focus students' attention on the lesson.	The enduring understandings clearly reflect the concepts, "big ideas", of the standard. The essential questions address the heart of the discipline and are framed to provoke interest and focus students' attention on the lesson.
Procedures			
Lesson Set (1, 8%) ACEI.1 ACEI.3 ACEI.3.a ACEI.3.b ACEI.3.c ACEI.3.d ACEI.3.e ACEI.4	The activities in the lesson set are not designed to capture students' attention, stimulate their	The activities in the lesson set are designed to capture students' attention. The activities do	The activities in the lesson set are designed to capture students' attention, stimulate their thinking and access prior

DRAFT

Rubric

	Unacceptable (1 pt)	Acceptable (2 pts)	Target (3 pts)
	thinking or access prior knowledge. Activities do not allow for learners to relate the lesson's goals and objectives to previous learning and to real-life experiences.	not draw on students' prior knowledge. Activities do not allow for learners to relate the lesson's goals and objectives to previous learning and/or to real-life experiences.	knowledge. Activities allow for learners to relate the lesson's goals and objectives to previous learning and to real-life experiences.
Learning Experiences (2, 16%) ACEI.3.a ACEI.3.b ACEI.3.c ACEI.3.d ACEI.3.e ACEI.4 ACEI.5 NCATE.1.B	The instructional activities are not based on knowledge of students, and/or learning theory and/or curricular goals; a variety of teaching strategies encouraging development of critical thinking not evident; active engagement in learning and/or self-motivation and/or positive social interaction not evident; active inquiry and/or collaboration not evident; activities not listed in sequential order.	The instructional activities are based on knowledge of students, learning theory, curricular goals, fundamental concepts and procedures related to the content; use few teaching strategies encouraging development of critical thinking; some active engagement in learning, self-motivation, and positive social interaction; may create a supportive learning environment; techniques foster some active inquiry and collaboration; includes opportunities for students to expand and solidify	The instructional activities are based on knowledge of diverse students, learning theory, curricular goals, fundamental concepts and procedures related to the content; use a variety of teaching strategies encouraging development of critical thinking; foster active engagement in learning, self-motivation, and positive social interaction; creates a supportive learning environment; techniques foster active inquiry and collaboration; includes opportunities for students to expand and solidify conceptual understanding and apply skills in real-world situations; clearly stated in sequential order as they occur in the lesson.

DRAFT

Rubric

	Unacceptable (1 pt)	Acceptable (2 pts)	Target (3 pts)
		conceptual understanding and apply skills but not in a real-world situation; stated in sequential order as they occur in the lesson.	
Lesson Closure (1, 8%) ACEI.1 ACEI.3.b ACEI.3.d ACEI.4	Closure does not use student engagement strategy.	Closure uses student engagement strategy to include all students but does not summarize their learning relevant to the objective.	Closure uses a student engagement strategy to include all students summarizing their learning relevant to the objectives.
Assessment Evaluation (1, 8%) ACEI.4	Assessments for monitoring student progress towards meeting the lesson's objectives are not included and/or relevant to the lesson.	Assessments for monitoring student progress towards meeting the lesson objectives are included. On-going assessments include diagnostic, formative and summative strategies.	Assessments for monitoring student progress towards meeting the lesson objectives are included and easily implemented. On-going assessments include diagnostic, formative and summative strategies. Students create artifact/s or products as a result of the lesson to demonstrate conceptual understanding and skill mastery.
Adaptations for Special Learners (1, 8%) ACEI.1 ACEI.3 ACEI.3.a ACEI.3.b	Adaptations or modifications for special needs learners are not planned. Extensions	Adaptations or modifications for special learners are summarized. Extensions	Adaptations or modifications are summarized for students who have special needs, limited English speaking

DRAFT

Rubric

	Unacceptable (1 pt)	Acceptable (2 pts)	Target (3 pts)
	and/or remediation activities are not well-developed.	and remediation activities are planned.	skills, academic needs (e.g. low skilled, gifted or very academically advanced). Extensions are developed to foster depth and challenge. Remediation activities are developed to re-teach for students who need more instruction/practice.
Differentiated Instruction (1, 8%) ACEI.1 ACEI.3.a ACEI.3.b ACEI.3.c ACEI.3.d ACEI.5	Summary of differentiated instructional strategies is vague.	Summary addresses how the lesson was adjusted-content, process, products, and/or environment-based on readiness, interests, and/or learning styles of students.	Summary reflects principles of differentiation and clearly addresses how the lesson was adjusted-content, process, products, and/or environment-based on readiness, interests, and/or learning styles of students.
Resources			
Materials Supplies Technology (1, 8%) ACEI.3.d ACEI.3.e	A listing of student and teacher materials needed to facilitate lesson activities is not all inclusive. Technology resources listed reflect limited teacher's knowledge of and competency with software programs, computer hardware, internet	A listing of student and teacher materials needed to facilitate lesson activities. Technology resources listed reflect teacher's knowledge of and competency with software programs, computer hardware, internet navigation,	A detailed listing of student and teacher materials/supplies needed to facilitate lesson activities. Technology resources listed reflect teacher's proficient knowledge of and competency with software programs, computer hardware, internet navigation, applets, cameras, projectors, etc. Copyrighted

DRAFT

Rubric

	Unacceptable (1 pt)	Acceptable (2 pts)	Target (3 pts)
	navigation, cameras, projectors, etc. Copyrighted material information is not included.	applets, cameras, projectors, etc. Copyrighted materials include author, date, city and publisher. Web addresses are listed.	materials include author, date, city and publisher. Web addresses are hyperlinked.
Personal Growth			
Reflection (1, 8%) ACEI.5	Self-assessment, reflection, and peer review not evident.	Self-assesses and reflects as an opportunity to grow professionally.	Self-assesses and seeks peer review feedback as opportunities to grow professionally.

Edit

Standards

ACEI.1

Development, Learning and Motivation--Candidates know, understand, and use the major concepts, principles, theories, and research related to development of children and young adolescents to construct learning opportunities that support individual students' development, acquisition of knowledge, and motivation.

ACEI.2.a

...Central concepts, tools of inquiry, and structures of content--Candidates know, understand, and use the central concepts, tools of inquiry, and structures of content for students across the K-6 grades and can create meaningful learning experiences that develop students' competence in subject matter and skills for various developmental levels

ACEI.2.i

...Connections across the curriculum--Candidates know, understand, and use the connections among concepts, procedures, and applications from content areas to motivate elementary students, build understanding, and encourage the application of knowledge, skills, and ideas to real world issues.

ACEI.3

INSTRUCTION

ACEI.3.a

...Integrating and applying knowledge for instruction--Candidates plan and implement instruction based on knowledge of students, learning theory, subject matter, curricular goals, and community

ACEI.3.b

...Adaptation to diverse students--Candidates understand how elementary students differ in their development and approaches to learning, and create instructional opportunities that are adapted to diverse students

ACEI.3.c

...Development of critical thinking, problem solving, performance skills--Candidates understand and use a variety of teaching strategies that encourage elementary students' development of critical thinking, problem solving, and performance skills

ACEI.3.d

...Active engagement in learning--Candidates use their knowledge and understanding of individual and group motivation and behavior among students at the K-6 level to foster active engagement in learning, self motivation, and positive social interaction and to create supportive learning environments

DRAFT

ACEI.3.e

...Communication to foster collaboration--Candidates use their knowledge and understanding of effective verbal, nonverbal, and media communication techniques to foster active inquiry, collaboration, and supportive interaction in the elementary classroom

ACEI.4

ASSESSMENT for instruction--Candidates know, understand, and use formal and informal assessment strategies to plan, evaluate and strengthen instruction that will promote continuous intellectual, social, emotional, and physical development of each elementary student.

ACEI.5

PROFESSIONALISM

NCATE.1.B

> Pedagogical Content Knowledge: Teacher candidates have a broad knowledge of instructional strategies that draws upon content and pedagogical knowledge and skills delineated in professional, state, and institutional standards to help all students learn. They facilitate student learning of the subject matter through presentation of the content in clear and meaningful ways and through the integration of technology. [Acceptable]

For more information on designing effective rubrics visit ODU's Office of Assessment website.

Resource: "Do's and Don't's of Designing Scoring Rubrics", ELCC website; "Scoring Rubric Development: Validity and reliability." Moskal, Barbara M. & Jon A. Leydens Practical Assessment, Research and Evaluation, 7(3).